

# ACTIVITY 4

## THE HOUSE ANALOGY

### Learning Objective

Students will use a story called *The House* as an analogy to the history of land 'ownership' in the NWT. Students will learn about our relationship to the land through the analogy, and make a personal connection to these concepts.

### Time

60 minutes + time in the next few activities

» **NOTE:** DO NOT COMPLETE IT ALL IN ONE CLASS. Students will need time during the next few activities to add to the table as they learn the history. For this class, just read the story and ask them to fill in the connections that they know now. For example, they should be able to fill in the first 6 items in the chart. The rest they will learn in the next few activities and then go back to it to fill in.

### Curricular Link

Outcomes that should be addressed through this activity include:

Component	Skills Outcome	Module Outcome
House Analogy	S.5.c,f	4.1, 4.2, 4.12

### Preparation and Materials List

- Have ready the story: *The House Analogy*
- Have ready the chart: *The House Analogy*
- Cartoon by Alooktook Ipellie – for assessment when students have had time to complete the full chart

### Possible Assessment Activities

- Writing a story to go with the cartoon by Alooktook Ipellie. Use this assessment activity only after students have had a chance to fill in the full chart – potentially after activity 8.



*In 1977 the Dogrib Rae Chief and Band Council didn't agree that they had ceded their land in Treaty 11 so they wrote an amendment. The photo was taken in front of the band office at Fort Rae in 1977.*

Native Communication Society.

## Making the Connection for the Teacher

This activity is intended to help students appreciate what the NWT land claims processes have achieved and what they have not. To understand this history, students will need to begin to understand significant details including the names of organizations, challenging vocabulary, laws and policies – but don't expect all of this now; this house story is just planting the seeds.

This activity, through the use of a story, helps to give the context within which the details will be added over the next few activities. The intent is to make connections between all the separate pieces they are learning about, and then put them together.

The story called *The House* was originally written by Murray Angus, as an analogy for the history of Nunavut for students in that territory. It is adapted here with permission, and gives a useful way for students to understand NWT land claims in general.

## Ideas from Teachers

I had my students close their eyes when I read the story – I didn't hand it out right away. I read it slowly to them. I asked them to keep their eyes closed while I was reading but to put up their hands when they thought they knew what the 'house' was. It was interesting to see when the hands would start to go up. After a few hands were up I stopped reading and we had a class discussion about the house representing the land and a reminder of what an analogy is. I then asked them to close their eyes again and continued reading.

*Northern Studies 10 Pilot teacher*



*President of the Indian Brotherhood, James Wah-Shee talks with Julian Yendo and Judge Sissons in Wrigley, 1973.*

Credit: Native Communications Society

## Steps

### The House Analogy (60 min)

1. Photocopy and hand out a class set of story, *The House Analogy*.
2. Remind students that an analogy is drawing a comparison between two or more things in order to show some similarity.
3. Read *The House Analogy* out loud to your students.
4. After you have read through the story ask students what they think the story is trying to say in general. Next, hand out a copy of the *The House Analogy* chart which takes some sections of the story and asks students to think about what each is analogous to.
5. Give students a few moments to go through the chart on their own and fill in any of the blanks. After a few moments ask students what they have been able to fill in – they should be able to fill in numbers 1-6 at this stage.

## Ideas from Teachers

I made one large chart and posted it in the classroom and over the next few classes we filled it in together. This visual really helped them.

*Northern Studies 10 Pilot teacher*

6. For sections they don't know, leave them blank and tell them that over the next few activities they will be learning about certain events which will help them fill in their charts. **DON'T GIVE THEM ALL THE ANSWERS.**

» **NOTE:** Don't give them the table with the answers of the house story as this is for the teacher only, as the students will be filling it in over the next few lessons. Also, the text in the teacher answer key is just a suggestion for what could go there. Students may find other examples that are analogous to the story.



## THE HOUSE ANALOGY

Imagine a house, a large house - a veritable mansion. Despite its many rooms, only a few people live in it - and they move around from room to room freely. They have lived there a long, long time - as long as anyone can remember - since the world was new.

Their history is embedded in the walls of the house; their stories are in the air. They have touched every part of the house, over many generations. This has always been their home and they have taken care of it well.

They live in the mansion quietly. No one has ever disturbed them. And although they have their differences and sometimes have disputes between people in other rooms and sometimes even wars, they follow their own laws and customs.

One day, out of the blue, a stranger or 'newcomer' marches through the door. He wears odd clothes. He carries strange equipment. He scans the room, looking right past the people who live there, and does not acknowledge them. He spreads his stuff on the floor and soon walks out.

The people in the room watch, but say nothing.

A short while later, another stranger came into the house; this time accompanied by several others. They, too, bring their stuff with them. They stay longer, but they begin to see that the original inhabitants know how to live in the house, so some of the strangers begin to live with original inhabitants to see how things work. In some parts of the house it is a good arrangement and the small numbers of newcomers are tolerated.

For some time this arrangement works pretty well. Some of newcomers that were respectful to the original inhabitants are welcomed and many of the valuables in the house are shared.

Gradually, more strangers come into the house, each with their own stuff. By now things are starting to change. The strangers are beginning to notice more of the valuables in the house and feel more comfortable in the house - even starting to feel like they own the house.

Many of the original inhabitants are starting to fall ill. An awful sickness has fallen upon the house and most of original inhabitants spend their time worrying about the ill and caring for those who are sick so don't have time to pay attention to the strangers.

But still more strangers come.

By now, even the newcomers admit that it is awkward living in this situation. The two groups are no longer living like family and it is clear that if the newcomers want to stay they are going to have to make a deal to buy the house or pay rent.

When the strangers find that there is treasure in some of the rooms, they rush to buy that part of the house from the original inhabitants. "We are brothers," the original inhabitants say, "and we can share the wealth in those rooms." With that, the newcomers move into the room (where the walls are painted as brightly as gold) and promise that the original inhabitants can come and go as they please.

A short while later, the newcomers find more treasure under another room in the house. This room has walls as shiny and black as pitch. Excited, they make another deal with the original inhabitants promising that they will not interfere with life as it has always been as long as they can dig for that valuable treasure. The original inhabitants make the same offer they always have, offering to share the wealth of the land in exchange for friendship, medical help (the sickness is still in the house) and education. Both parties shake on their new deal and the newcomers start clearing the furniture to dig.



But they can't come and go as they please. When the original inhabitants try to use the golden room or the room as black as pitch they find that there are many newcomers working to tear up the floor and carpets. They find that they are told where and when they can come into the room. Although they are upset, the original inhabitants make the best of it and continue to tend to their sick.

Again, in the very far end of the mansion, in the rooms where very few newcomers have ever visited, more treasure is found. The newcomers are again excited about their discovery and start to make a new deal with the owners of these rooms. But the people here have seen the state of the other rooms. "Why," they ask, "do we, the original owners, now live at the edges of the rooms and in the closets? Why does it seem that you newcomers are the sole owners of this house when you are just guests?"

"Never mind," say the newcomers, "we will be fair with you. Let us dig for treasure and we will not stop you from living as you always have." The newcomers had already started to clear a path from the back of the mansion to the front door to take their treasure. They have maps and plans to march this treasure right through the middle of the house!

While the old people remained afraid of the newcomers, some of the younger generation were not; they had grown up with the newcomers' ways, and were able to deal with them with greater confidence, using the newcomer's language.

The original inhabitants of the home began to meet amongst themselves and compare notes about what was happening in all the different parts of the house. They found that they were all experiencing the same thing whether they lived in the golden room, the room as black as pitch or in the far back of the mansion: they were being ignored, pushed aside, and marginalized - denied the right to live their own lives according to their own cultural values. They were also seeing their house being taken over by these newcomers, who were now making plans to empty the house of its contents and they were not treating the house respectfully.

"Enough," says the group of people at the back of the mansion.

"Enough," says the group in the room as dark as pitch.

"Enough," says the group in in the golden room.

"Why?" say the newcomers. "Are we not brothers? Have we not promised to share the wealth of this house?"

And now the anger and frustration of the people comes flooding out. The newcomers are so surprised that they send a spokesman to listen and calm the people down. When he travels around he realizes that all over the house the people are forming groups and saying the same thing. What he hears surprises the newcomers. "This is our house," the people say. "We promised to share, but we did not promise to give up everything. You are destroying our house and telling us what to do right here in our own house. It is time to stop and sit down and figure out how we got into this mess."

"We can solve this problem," say the newcomers. "If you become just like us we will all own this house together. There is no point in having newcomers and original inhabitants, let's all just be 'house owners' together."

"That," said the people, "is a very bad idea. We are like you in some ways, but in others we are very different." The original inhabitants realized they would be stronger together so they decided to form organizations. These organizations told the newcomers, "this is our house and we have promised to take care of it forever - we are the original owners of this house. We will not give up that responsibility. But as we have always said, we will share this house with you."

By now the newcomers had begun to realize that things had changed. When they looked around at the state of the house - the holes in the floor, the furniture toppled over, the people forced to live in closets or wherever they could find room - they realized that things needed to change. "You know," they said, "maybe we could make a fair deal. We really did think you





had sold us your house, but perhaps you do not. Let's see if we can make a better deal."

The newcomers started at the back of the mansion. They offered to give the people there exclusive rights to all the closet space in the mansion, plus a lot of money that they could then use to buy things from the newcomers.

To the newcomers' surprise, the offer was rejected. The original inhabitants put up a sign on the front door saying: "this house is not for sale!" They said, "We will share it with you but we want to always have a say in what happens in our house and you must recognize that we are the original owners of this house."

"Then we'll offer you even more money!" the newcomers pleaded. But the people stood firm, because they knew that if they signed away all the rights to their house, they would never have the power to influence what happened to it in the future. And if they took the money, it would soon be spent and they'd be left with nothing.

For a while, the two sides refused to budge. Each side claimed to own the house and all its contents. Neither side was willing to concede to the other.

At a certain point, however, the original inhabitants themselves took steps to break the deadlock. They realized that the newcomers were here to stay, and they were always going to have to live with them in the house. They also knew that the newcomers were really committed to "owning" the house, because to them ownership meant having control of everything.

So the people put forth an offer: they said they would allow the newcomers to own lots of the space in their rooms... IF the newcomers agreed that all decisions about the house and its contents would be made jointly with the them.

Well, the newcomers had to think about this unexpected offer – they were used to one side winning everything and the other side losing. The idea of sharing decision-making power was new to them. After long and careful thought, however, they decided that they would accept this arrangement.

"Great," said the people. "But that's not all! We also want you to give us millions of dollars in exchange for giving up our claim to owning all the house."

"Hmmm ... well ... OK," said the newcomers.

"And that's not all," the people said. "We also want a share of any money you make from any valuables that are sold."

"And that's not all!" the people said. "We also want to ensure that throughout the house we can continue to use it the way we always have, without restrictions."

"Hmmm...well...as long as those uses don't hurt the house, then okay," said the newcomers.

"And that's not all!" the people said. "We also want guarantees that if anyone gets hired to look after the house or the yard outside, a fair share of those jobs has to come to us."

"OK," the newcomers said, getting a bit exasperated.

And the newcomers said, "So, if we agree to all these things you've been asking for, then will you agree to surrender your ownership of the house?"

And the answer came back: "We will, but only if we really have to."

"Wow", said the newcomers, "this is going to be harder than we thought." But the newcomers and the people worked, room by room, to make deals. The people in each room wanted something slightly different, but each wanted to maintain control of their room and to ensure a good future for their people living there.

And you know what? The people and the newcomers have not finished figuring things out yet! Even now, the people and the newcomers are talking about how to make fair deals, how to share the house.

'How long do you think this will take?' asked the newcomers - they were always more impatient than the original inhabitants.

The people thought about the question and said, "As long as this house shall last."



## THE HOUSE ANALOGY TABLE – **TEACHER KEY**

#	Description in House Story	Analogous to...
1	House	Denendeh, Nunakput (the land) or the NWT in general
2	Newcomers (strangers)	Any combination of traders, explorers, voyageurs, Hudson Bay Boys, church, government etc.
3	Original inhabitants	Inuvialuit, Dene and Cree
4	Some of newcomers that were respectful to the original inhabitants are welcomed and much of the valuables in the house is shared	The Fur Trade – could also mention this is when the Métis would be part of the story
5	Valuables	Fur, oil and gas, minerals, water, trees, fish
6	An awful sickness has fallen upon the house	Epidemics of influenza, scarlet fever, measles and more
7	The Golden Room	The gold rush in the NWT and Yukon began in 1897
8	and promise that the original inhabitants can come and go as they please.	Treaty 8 was signed in 1899 – Promises made in treaty that, ‘as long as the sun shines we will not be restricted from our way of life’.
9	The Oil Room	Treaty 11 was signed to allow access to the oil deposits at Norman Wells/Tulita – again promises are made that ‘as long as the sun shines we will not be restricted from or way of life’
10	But they can’t come and go as they please.	Students could use any number of examples that they’ve learned from the other modules such as:  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Residential School where children were forcibly removed from their families and those who didn’t send their children could be arrested</li> <li>• Michael Sikyea of Yellowknife was arrested by the RCMP for shooting a duck “out of season” in 1964. Also, the government of Canada created game sanctuaries where nobody was allowed to hunt. The Supreme Court eventually found that the government of Canada has breached Treaty 11.</li> </ul>
11	The Rooms at the back of the mansion	Inuvialuit region
12	They have maps and plans to march this treasure right through the middle of the house!	The 1970s Mackenzie Valley Gas Pipeline proposal



13	they had grown up with the newcomers' ways, and were able to deal with them with greater confidence.	Many of the younger generation had gone to residential school – could speak and write English and were not afraid to deal with the newcomers.
14	Younger generation	Students should be able to name at least two prominent people who helped to negotiate or are currently negotiating on behalf of the land claim in their area.
15	began to meet amongst themselves	At residential school, people from all over the north made connections with each other. When some left school they kept their connections and communicated about issues in their communities.
16	The newcomers are so surprised that they send a spokesman to listen and calm the people down.	Justice Berger and the Berger Inquiry in the early 1970s– he went to every community and wall tent in outpost camps to listen to the people – students should recall from Module 3 that he concluded that no pipeline/development could occur until land claims were settled.
17	if you become just like us we will all own this house together.	Ottawa releases “White Paper” in 1969 proposing to do away with any special rights for Aboriginal peoples (including previous treaties with First Nations). The Trudeau government explicitly denies that Aboriginal rights can still exist.
18	Decided to form organizations	COPE, ITK, Indian Brotherhood (now the Dene Nation)
19	wanted newcomers to recognize they were the original owners of the house	In 1973 the Supreme Court of Canada ruled in the Calder case that native people who had never signed treaties (such as the Inuit) could still have their Aboriginal title to the land. This ran counter to all of the government’s assumptions, and forced it to reconsider its approach to the issue.
20	They offered to give the people exclusive rights to all the closet space in the mansion, plus a lot of money that they could then use to buy things from the newcomers.	In 1973 the Government of Canada announced a Comprehensive Land Claims Policy. It called for undefined Aboriginal rights to be extinguished in exchange for a package including limited amounts of land, special hunting and fishing rights, and millions of dollars in cash.  Aboriginal groups in the North rejected this offer, arguing that it would leave them with little power to influence the future development of the North.



21	It got so bad that the original inhabitants put up a big sign on the front door saying, 'This house is not for sale!'	<p>Their response to the Comprehensive Land Claims Policy was "this land is not for sale!" In 1973 a group of Dene Chiefs filed a caveat (a declaration of prior interest in the land) to 450,000 square miles of traditional land to the Supreme Court of the NWT. The Chiefs wanted to claim the land by virtue of their Aboriginal rights, and prevent further development until ownership had been settled.</p> <p>It came to be known as the Paulette Caveat, named after François Paulette, who was chief in Fort Smith at the time, and one of the chiefs who initiated the caveat.</p>
22	the two sides refused to budge.	During the 1970s and 1980s, negotiations focussed on how and what would be negotiated. The ideas of self-government and Aboriginal rights were just emerging in the Constitution Act and elsewhere.
23	They also knew that the newcomers were really committed to "owning" the house, because to them ownership meant having control of everything.	In the non-Aboriginal tradition, 'owning' means complete control. The Government of Canada wanted to see an ' <i>extinguishment</i> ' of Aboriginal title to the land allowing them complete control.
24	So the people put forth an offer: they said they would allow the newcomers to own lots of space in their rooms...	COPE negotiated an agreement (first one in the NWT) where roughly 80% of the land was given to the Government of Canada in exchange for...
25	If the newcomers agreed that all decisions about the house and its contents would be made jointly with 'the people'.	<p>The Inuvialuit Final Agreement (IFA) establishes and provides for Inuvialuit participation on various co-management boards within the Inuvialuit Settlement Region. These include the Fisheries Joint Management Committee, Wildlife Management Advisory Council (NWT), Wildlife Management Advisory Council (North Slope), Environmental Impact Screening Committee and Environmental Impact Review Board. The IFA also establishes the Inuvialuit Game Council to promote and protect Inuvialuit wildlife interests.</p> <p>Other landclaims that came after made similar provisions.</p>
26	We also want you to give us millions of dollars in exchange for giving up our claim to owning all the house.	Each agreement signed provides for financial compensation from the federal government to the Aboriginal governments.
27	We also want a share of any money you make from any valuables that are sold.	Each agreement signed provides for financial share of resources from the land.





28	<p>"And that's not all!" the people said. "We also want to ensure that throughout the house we can continue to use it the way we always have; without restrictions."</p>	<p>The Inuvialuit retain the right to hunt and fish anywhere in their territory and have subsurface rights to 13,000 square kilometres</p>
29	<p>"And that's not all!" the people said. "We also want guarantees, that if anyone gets hired to look after the house or the yard outside, a fair share of those jobs has to come to us."</p>	<p>Each agreement negotiated has provisions to ensure employment of the people.</p>
30	<p>And the newcomers said: "So, if we agree to all these things you've been asking for, then will you agree to surrender your ownership of the house?"</p> <p>And the answer came back: "We will, but only if we really have to."</p>	<p>The Inuvialuit were the first in the NWT to sign a comprehensive land claim in 1984.</p>
31	<p>But the newcomers and the people worked, room by room, to make deals.</p>	<p>Gwich'in Final Agreement (1992)</p> <p>Sahtu-Métis Final Agreement (1993)</p> <p>Separation of Nunavut became official in 1999.</p> <p>Tłı̨chǫ Final Agreement (2005) (First self-government agreement)</p> <p>Devolution Agreement (2014)</p> <p>Déline became the Northwest Territories' first self-government community (September 1, 2016)</p>
32	<p>Even now, the people and the newcomers are talking about how to make fair deals</p>	<p>As of 2016 the Dehcho, Akaitcho and Métis are still negotiating agreements. Also, many self-government negotiations are still ongoing.</p> <p>Students and teachers could also talk here about devolution; the transfer of authority from the federal government to the GNWT. Devolution has reopened many of the debates about land and land ownership and who has decision-making authority that have existed since the time of treaty making.</p>
33	<p>As long as this house shall last.</p>	<p>This is a reference to the promises contained in Treaties 8 and 11 that the agreement signed between Aboriginal nations and the Crown was to be '<i>as long as this land shall last.</i>' You could also have a class discussion as to what that means in today's context, and how we are 'all treaty people'.</p>



## THE HOUSE ANALOGY

#	Description in House Story	Analogous to...
1	House	
2	Newcomers (strangers)	
3	Original inhabitants	
4	Some of newcomers that were respectful to the original inhabitants are welcomed and much of the valuables in the house is shared	
5	Valuables	
6	An awful sickness has fallen upon the house	
7	The Golden Room	
8	and promise that the original inhabitants can come and go as they please.	
9	The Oil Room	
10	But they can't come and go as they please.	
11	The Rooms at the back of the mansion	
12	They have maps and plans to march this treasure right through the middle of the house!	
13	they had grown up with the newcomers' ways, and were able to deal with them with greater confidence.	
14	Younger generation	
15	began to meet amongst themselves	



16	The newcomers are so surprised that they send a spokesman to listen and calm the people down.	
17	if you become just like us we will all own this house together.	
18	Decided to form organizations	
19	wanted newcomers to recognize they were the original owners of the house	
20	They offered to give the people exclusive rights to all the closet space in the mansion, plus a lot of money that they could then use to buy things from the newcomers.	
21	It got so bad that the original inhabitants put up a big sign on the front door saying, 'This house is not for sale!'	
22	the two sides refused to budge.	
23	They also knew that the newcomers were really committed to "owning" the house, because to them ownership meant having control of everything.	
24	So the people put forth an offer: they said they would allow the newcomers to own lots of space in their rooms...	
25	If the newcomers agreed that all decisions about the house and its contents would be made jointly with 'the people'.	
26	We also want you to give us millions of dollars in exchange for giving up our claim to owning all the house.	
27	We also want a share of any money you make from any valuables that are sold.	



28	<p>"And that's not all!" the people said. "We also want to ensure that throughout the house we can continue to use it the way we always have; without restrictions."</p>	
29	<p>"And that's not all!" the people said. "We also want guarantees, that if anyone gets hired to look after the house or the yard outside, a fair share of those jobs has to come to us."</p>	
30	<p>And the newcomers said: "So, if we agree to all these things you've been asking for, then will you agree to surrender your ownership of the house?"</p> <p>And the answer came back: "We will, but only if we really have to."</p>	
31	<p>But the newcomers and the people worked, room by room, to make deals.</p>	
32	<p>Even now, the people and the newcomers are talking about how to make fair deals</p>	
33	<p>As long as this house shall last.</p>	